

**Village of Pittsford  
Architectural and Preservation Review Board  
Special Meeting – December 3, 2008 at 7:00 PM**

**PRESENT:**

<b>Chairperson:</b>	<b>Paul Zachman</b>
<b>Members:</b>	<b>Maria Huot Cristina Lanahan William McBride Erin Daniele (absent)</b>
<b>Building Inspector:</b>	<b>Skip Bailey</b>
<b>Village Attorney:</b>	<b>Jeff Turner (absent)</b>
<b>Recording Secretary:</b>	<b>Linda Habeeb</b>

Chairperson Zachman called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm.

**1. Soren Eriksson, 27 Rand Place ~ Roof**

**Present:** Karl Eriksson, Homeowners

**Application:** Submitted, date-stamped, and Building Inspector reviewed on 12-02-08.

**Discussion:** The applicants are requesting approval to replace the existing roof on their house with a standing seam style metal roof. The applicants stated that the existing roof is deteriorated and in need of replacement, and they had determined that a metal roof was the most durable material for the replacement roof.

Board members discussed the style of the house and whether the proposed metal roof was compatible with that style and with the character of the surrounding neighborhood. Chairperson Zachman stated, as a finding of fact, that the existing roof is a conventional asphalt shingle roof that, in form, replaced an original cedar shake roof. The asphalt shingle roof, in and of itself, is not a unique architectural feature, but it has become a standard replacement for older shake roofs and is the most common roofing material in use.

Board members discussed the fact that metal was available and was used as roofing material during the era of the home. They determined that the proposed roof in this case is similar to a metal roof that would have been installed in that era, and that the installation and manufacture are essentially the same. The style of the proposed roof is similar to the original and is compatible with the style of house and character of the surrounding neighborhood.

Chairperson Zachman also noted, as to the method of installation of the roof, that there are no visible surface fasteners, the metal panels mount directly to a solid substrate with no built-up purlins, and it is not being installed over any prior layers of roofing, thereby allowing for traditional rake and drip edge appearance. Also, the rake edge trim is a drip cap that does not elevate and box over the top of a standard rake eave, and the factory finish is matte and can be painted over.

The Board also discussed a proposal that came before the APRB in 2004 to replace a tin/metal roof with asphalt architectural shingles on an 1896 farmhouse located at 84 South Street. This alteration was made on a residential property that is similar in age and style to 27 Rand Place. Photos of the house at 84 South Street before the asphalt roof installation depict a standing seam metal

roof, and the roof was thought to be a very old, if not original, installation. The Board used this information as part of their determination as to whether a standing seam metal style roof would have been appropriate for a residential home in the Village of Pittsford.

Chairperson Zachman stated that this proposal is an alteration, and he reviewed the Village Code requirements regarding alterations to homes:

**§ 210-61. Standards for review.**

The APRB shall be guided by the following standards in issuing a certificate of approval:

**A. Alterations and additions**

1) Alterations and additions to existing buildings shall either be made consistent with the spirit of their architectural style or shall alter the structure to an appearance consistent with the architectural styles of historic value existing in the district. Alternatively, contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties may be permitted when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material and such design is compatible with the size, scale, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment. In applying the principles of consistency and compatibility with the architectural styles existing in the District, the APRB shall consider the following factors: composition, design, texture and other visual qualities.

***Findings of Fact:***

The Village of Pittsford Architectural and Preservation Review Board finds that:

- The metal roofing material: Everlast Everseam 19.5" wide, 1" high standing seam, 24 ga. flat metal:
  - It is a true standing seam style roofing material, 24 gauge with no corrugations or stamp patterns.
  - There are no visible surface fasteners.
  - The metal panels mount directly to a solid substrate with no built up purlins, and it is not being installed over any prior layers of roofing, thereby allowing for traditional rake and drip edge appearance.
  - The rake edge trim is a drip cap that does not elevate and box over the top of a standard rake eave.
  - The factory finish is matte and can be painted over.
  - The roofing material and installation method as described above would be appropriate for a residential installation.
  - Other styles of metal roofing, such as corrugated metal panels with visible surface fasteners, non-traditional rake and drip edge cladding, and bulky hip capping and flashing methods, would not be appropriate for a residential neighborhood. That style of metal roofing is more common and appropriate for an agricultural/industrial setting, as is seen in the Schoen Place district.
  
- The Action: Alteration

- An existing roof is deteriorated and needs to be replaced. The existing roof is a conventional asphalt shingle roof that, in form, replaced an original cedar shake roof. The asphalt shingle roof, in and of itself, is not a unique architectural feature or an example of skilled craftsmanship, but it has become a standard replacement for older shake roofs and is the most common roofing material in use.
- The applicant is proposing to install a standing seam metal roof that will alter the appearance of the home.

➤ The House:

- Constructed in 1912
- This house embodies the simple, block-like massing, fenestration, and detailing that are representative of the Four-square style of domestic architecture common in the Village of Pittsford and the United States between 1900 and 1920.
- The 45-degree roof pitch and front gable are typical features of local early twentieth-century Four-square homes.
- Because the house is oriented with the gable facing the street and is situated on a narrow lot between two other homes, the field of the roof and the roof surface is not visually prominent from the “public way.”
- The roof line is simple without hips, valleys, or dormers. Changing the roof material will not significantly alter any character-defining feature of the home.
- The use of standing seam metal roofing was first popularized in mid-western New York in the mid-nineteenth century, and has been in use since that time. As a material, standing seam roofing never became as popular locally as in other regions of the nation.
- The Village of Pittsford retains a few historic examples of standing seam metal roofs from the early twentieth century, including the Village Hall, the blacksmith shop, hog shed, bull barn, and wagon shed at Pittsford Farms, and the kidney bean warehouses at the T. J. Zornow complex on Schoen Place.
- The roofing system proposed is visually similar to historic examples of standing seam roofing.

**Motion:** Based on the above-stated findings of fact, Chairperson Zachman made a ***motion***, seconded by Member McBride, to approve the metal roofing installation, contingent on the applicant’s painting the rake edge within an inch of the drip edge to affect color of the rake frieze trim if such trim exceeds 2” in depth.

**Vote:** McBride – yes; Zachman –yes; Lanahan – yes; Huot – yes. ***Motion carried.*** This decision was filed in the Office of the Village Clerk on December 3, 2008.

**ADJOURNMENT:** Chairperson Zachman adjourned the meeting at 5:00 pm.

Linda Habeeb, Recording Secretary

---